

**No. F.1/22(05)/2023-R.1**  
**UNION PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION**  
**RECRUITMENT-1 SECTION**

Name of the Post:	Final Short-listing criteria for recruitment to 15 ( SC-02, ST-02, EWS-02, OBC-03 & UR-06 including PH-01) posts of Specialist Grade III (Pathology) in the Non Teaching Specialist Sub Cadre of CHS in the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare by Direct Recruitment
Advertisement No:	11/2023
Recruitment Case Vacancy No.	23061102110
Date of interview	<b>To be declared later on</b>

1. **Essential Qualifications:-**

EDUCATION-(EQ-A)

(A) As indicated in Part-A, Section-A in Schedule-VI of CHS amendment Rules, 2019 i.e. **Doctor of Medicine (Pathology) or Diplomate National Board (Pathology) or Doctor of Philosophy (Pathology) or Doctor of Science (Pathology).**

**(B). Experience (EQ-B):** At least three years' experience in the concerned Specialty or Super Specialty after obtaining the first Post Graduate degree or five years' experience after obtaining the Post Graduate diploma.

The total numbers of effective applications is 167. All the applications have been considered.

2. **Modalities**

(i) PS has been done on the basis of the Scrutiny Report generated by the Computer System as per the information filled in by the candidates in the Online Recruitment Application (ORA) form and the documents/certificate uploaded with the ORA, in respect of candidates whose applications are prima-facie found eligible on the basis of information filled up/claims made by them in the online applications.

(ii) PS has been done strictly in accordance with Essential Educational and Experience qualifications prescribed for the post and the conditions laid down in the advertisement for the post.

(iii) The candidates who do not possess the relevant essential Educational qualifications have been rejected as **"LEQ-A"** (Lacking Essential Qualification-Academic). Like-wise, if Essential Experience (EQ-B) is not in the relevant field as specified in the Recruitment Rules of the post or relevant experience is less than the required period; such candidates have been rejected under **"LEQ-B"** (Lacking Essential Qualification – Experience). Candidates who do not meet the Enhanced criteria of Experience have been rejected as **"LEC"** (Lacking Enhanced Criteria of Experience).

(iv) Experience acquired as part time/ hourly basis/ daily wages/ visiting /Guest faculty/ Apprentice/ trainee/Consultant/ Honorary/ Internship period and Self-employed has not been counted while counting experience. However, Experience in permanent post of Consultant pathologist on full time basis has been considered as valid experience (Roll No.25).

(v) Some of the candidates can be rejected under more than one category. They have been rejected under category considered as most appropriate.

(vi) Experience certificates in prescribed proforma as per the advertisement have been considered. Wherever the applicants have not submitted experience certificates in prescribed proforma, their experience certificate have been considered on merit.

(vii) 50% relaxation in Experience criteria has been provided to 1 ST candidate (Roll No. 167) as there was no sufficient number of candidates from that category.

(viii) In the Advertisement, applicants were asked to upload all certificates/documents along with Online Applications; however, some applicants have not uploaded complete certificates/documents. Those candidates who have claimed Essential Qualifications and fulfill short-listing criteria but have not uploaded relevant documents have been provisionally shortlisted and suggested to **“Call For Documents” (CFD)**.

(ix) As the number of UR candidates are 131 (including 4 OBC candidates claimed Creamy Layer status) for five UR posts, Essential Qualification of Experience (EQ-B) has been enhanced from 3 years and above to 4 years and above to rationalize the number of UR candidates around the prescribed indicative limit approved by the Commission.

(x) OBC candidate claimed Creamy Layer status has been treated as General Candidate and processed as per the short-listing criteria adopted for General candidates.

(xi) The posts for which no application has been received or no candidates could be shortlisted has been declared as “Infructuous” at scrutiny stage.

(xii) OBC candidates who claimed Non-Creamy Layer (NCL) status, meet the Short-listing criteria, but not uploaded the OBC Non-Creamy Layer Certificate relevant to the recruitment year or uploaded old OBC-NCL certificates not relevant to the recruitment year, have been provisionally shortlisted and suggested to **“Call For Documents” (CFD)**. Likewise, EWS candidates who fulfill short-listing criteria but have not uploaded EWS certificate relevant to the recruitment year have also been provisionally shortlisted and suggested to **“Call For Documents” (CFD)**.

3. In response to the Advt 11/23, a total 167 (UR-127, EWS-0, OBC-17, SC-19 & ST-04 including PwBD 02) candidates have applied online. However, some deficiency in documents of following candidates have been noticed & call for which is required to be provided by 30 June 2024. The summary is tabulated below:-

Details	Candidates Category & Roll No				
	UR	OBC	SC	ST	Total
Call for documents Reply received within given time i.e by 30 June 2024	120	132, 134, 135, 136, 138, 139, 141, 142, 143	146,1 50,15 8	165	14
Reply received	120	134, 139	-	-	03

4. The following candidates have replied against CFD and the same is examined as under:-

Roll No	Documents called for	Remarks
120	An affidavit for change of Name	Requisite document has been submitted, hence the candidate is recommended to be shortlisted
134	OBC(NCL) for FY 2023-24	Requisite document has been submitted, hence the candidate is recommended to be shortlisted
139	OBC(NCL) for FY 2023-24	Requisite document has been submitted, hence the candidate is recommended to be shortlisted

5. With regards to OBC candidates for non submission of OBC (Non Creamy Layer) certificate for FY 2023-24, the OBC candidates who meets essential Qualification i. e EQ(A) + EQ(B) have been shortlisted by providing an opportunity to submit OBC (NCL) certificate at the time of interview. The list of candidates is tabulated below:-

OBC candidates Roll No	Candidate has Experience	Remarks for short-listing
132	03 years & more	Subject to submission of appropriate undertaking regarding Non Creamy Layer status at the time of interview.
135	03 years & more	
136	03 years & more	
138	03 years & more	
141	03 years & more	
142	03 years & more	

6. In addition the above, the following representations were received as window given to express their concerned for their rejection and the representations were examined as under:-

Roll No	Initial Rejection	Representation	Revised scrutiny
07/UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed experience of Srship from 23.09.16 to 24.01.17 i.e. 04 months, form 25.01. 17 to 24.09.19 i.e. 02 years & 08 months, form 26.09.19 to 23.12.19 i.e. 02 months 27 days, 01.01.20 to 31.12.20 i.e. 01 Year & 26.04.21 to 25.04.22 as attending Consultant i.e 01 year. Total experience 04 years 02 months excluding Consultant.	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology, hence the candidate is recommended to call for interview.
15/UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed in ORA for 03 years, 03 days but she has not enclosed any fresh experience certificate matching to her claim, her previous total experience is 03 years 03 days.	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology, hence rejection is maintained.
28/UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed experience from 22.03.21 to 07.10.21 as Consultant i.e. 06 months 15 days, Srship from 08.10.21 to 20.07.23 i.e. 01 years 09 months 13 days	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology, The earned as consultant is not counted for, hence rejection is maintained

33/ UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed experience from 24.10.17 to 05.03.18 as Srship i.e 04 months 12 days & from 09.03.18 to 30.05.19 i.e. 01 year 02 month 22 days as Transfusion medicine, from 31.05.19 to 11.05.21 i.e. 2 years 11 months 11 days, from 12.05.21 to 30.05.22 i.e 01 year, 18 days, from 30.06.22 to 21.06.23 i.e 11 months 21 days totaling to 03 years , 11 months & 01 day less transfusion Experience acquired.	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology on regular basis and transfusion Experience has not been accounted for, hence rejection is maintained.
44/ UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed experience from 12.08.16 to 05.04.22 as Consultant Pathologist i.e 05 year, 07 months 25 days which is not full time.	The experience is less than 04 years and consultant experience which is not full time, the same is not considered, hence rejection is maintained
54/ UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has now claimed experience from 18.01.23 to 20.01.24 in addition her ORA claimed experience of 03 years 05 months 18 days.	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology on regular basis i.e upto closing date of ORA, Experience acquired after closing date i.e. 29.06.23 is not considered. hence rejection is maintained.
70/ UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed experience from 01.08.18 to 01.08.19 i.e. one years as Asst Prof In Deptt of Pathology, 07.08.19 to 15.09.20 i.e. 01 year, one month & 07 days as Tutor & 02 years, 05 months & 07 days SR ship which total to 04 years, 06 months & 14 days	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology on regular basis, she has experience of 04 years & 6 months he may be shortlisted to call for interview
78/ UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed experience as SRship of 03 years 05 days and consultant experience from 19.09.22 to 15.04.23 i.e. 06 months 26 days.	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology on regular basis, hence rejection is maintained.
UR/ 84	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed experience in ORA is 03 years 07 month & 14 days and claimed consultant experience from 02 02.23 to 29 06.23 and agreement copy has been enclosed.	The experience is less than 04 years & the consultant experience which is not full time, therefore, the candidate has not been considered, hence rejection is maintained
88/ 89/ UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed experience three years SR ship experience 03 years only. No experience certificate has been enclosed now.	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology on regular basis, hence rejection is maintained.

93/ UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed experience from 14-10-2015 To 18-10-2018 (3 years 4 days), 30-10-2020 To 30-10-2021 (1 year) as Consultant and 19.05.22 to 29.06.23 i.e. 01 years 10 days totaling to 04 years 14 days less consultant experience	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology on regular basis, he has experience of 04 years, she may be shortlisted to call for interview.
104/ UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed experience from 02.03.16 to 01.03.19 ie 03 years as SRship and experience from 09.09.20 to 19.06.23 ie 02 years 09 months & 10 days which is totaling to 05 years, 09 months & 10 days.	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology on regular basis, she has experience of 04 years, he may be shortlisted to call for interview.
107/ UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed experience from 22.06.17 to 21.06.20 (2 years 11 months 29 days) as SRship in Pathology, from 30.05.21 to 26.10.21 as Lab Head, from 23.07.16 to 28.07.17 (4 months 27 days) as Demonstrator, from 03.04.17 to 21.06.17 as Srship in Oncology Lab. (2 months 18 days) total to 3 years 07 months & 15 days.	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology on regular basis, hence rejection is maintained.
109/ UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed for acceptance of his disability and 01 UR vacancy to be transferred to Advt No 10/24 but not enclosed experience certificate.	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology on regular basis, hence rejection is maintained
123/ UR	Lacking of enhanced criteria	The candidate has claimed suitability based on sufficient experience for 04 years without any documentary support of experience certificate in Deptt of Pathology. Only Appoint/ transfer letter have been enclosed.	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology on regular basis, hence rejection is maintained
124/ UR		The candidate has claimed experience from 17.06.19 to 16.06.22 as SRship for 03 years, from 08.07.22 to 29.06.23 ie 11 months, 21 days, totaling to 3 years, 11 months & 21 days	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology on regular basis, hence rejection is maintained
140/ OBC	LEQ(A)	The candidate is claiming PG Diploma suitable for the post stating that as per CHS rule 2019, Schedule VI, Section B provides the essential qualification for Post Graduate Diploma Holders and EQ(B) also states that 05 years experience is required for Post Graduate Diploma holder. The candidate has more than 10 years experience in Pathology.	As per the enhanced criteria for UR candidate for the post, the candidates who have PG Degree (Pathology) are required to achieve 04 years experience in Pathology on regular basis. However, Schedule VI, Section B CHS rule 2019 is not applicable for this post, hence rejection is maintained.

164/ ST	LEQ(B)	The candidate has claimed experience from 26.11.20 to 26.03.21 i.e. for 04 months, & 06 days, from 30.03.21 to 26.06.1 i.e. 02 months 27 days, from 17.12.21 to 6 months & 12 days and 17-12-2021 To 29-06-2023 (1 year 6 months 12 days but not enclosed experience certificate). Total claimed experience is 02 years, 01 months & 15 days	The ST candidate has claimed experience 02 years 15 days but experience certificate enclosed 10 months 16 days and forwarded GNCT Delhi appointment letter for her claim. She entitled for 50% relaxation on experience which arrived at 01 years 06 months, but lacks of experience certificate of minimum 50% experience, hence rejection is maintained
------------	--------	--	---

7. **Final Short-Listing Criteria** Based on the above facts, the following criterion has been adopted for short-listing :-

**Category wise Criterion**

(a) **Short-Listing Criteria for 06-UR Vacancy**

**Criterion:- EQ(A)+EQ(B) raised from 3 years and above to 4 years & above.**

**Short-listed** : Roll No 04, 05, 06, 07, 13, 16, 18, 22, 25, 27, 29, 31, 35, 36, 37, 38, 41, 46, 48, 49, 50, 53, 58, 59, 60, 62, 67, 69, 70, 75, 77, 80, 86, 93, 98, 102, 104, 106, 112, 117, 120 & 127 = 42 Candidates

**OBC (CL) category Candidates:** Roll No : Roll No : 128,129, 130 & 131= 04 candidates being OBC (CL) category Candidates has been considered as UR candidates.

**Rejected:- (i) LEC** : Roll No: 03, 08, 10, 17, 21, 28, 32, 33, 34, 42, 44, 51, 63, 66, 79, 82, 83, 85, 87, 90, 94, 96, 97, 108, 109, 110, 113, 114, 118,119, 123, 125, 128 & 130 = 35 Candidates

(ii) **LEQ (A)** : Roll No 57= 01 candidate.

(iii) **Duplicate Application** ; Roll No 88 of Roll No 89= 01 candidature

(iv) **Out of Consideration Zone**= Remaining 51 Candidates.

(b) **Short-Listing Criteria for 03-OBC Vacancies**

**Criterion:- EQ(A) +EQ(B)**

**Short-listed** : Roll No 132, 134, 135, 136, 138, 139, 141, 142 & 144 =09 Candidates

**Rejected :** (i) **LEQ(B)**: Roll No 133 & 137 = 02 candidates

(ii) **LEQ(A)**: Roll No 140 = 01 candidate

(iii) **Non response to CFDs** : 143= 01 candidate

(c) **Short-Listing Criteria for 02-SC Vacancies**

Criterion:- **EQ(A)+EQ(B)**

**Short-listed** : Roll No 145, 147, 148, 151, 152, 153, 155, 157, 159, 160, 161, 162 & 163 =13 Candidates

**Subject to submission of:-**

**Rejected : LEQ(B):** Roll No 146, 149, 150, 154, 156 & 158 = 06 candidates

(d) **Short-Listing Criteria for 02-ST Vacancy**

Criterion:- EQ(A)+EQ(B) relaxed upto 50%

**Short-listed** : Roll No 166 & 167 =02 Candidates

**Rejected : (i) LEQ(B):** Roll No 164= 01 candidate

**(ii) Non response to CFDs :** 165 = 01 candidate

(e) **Infructuous**

(i) **EWS:** No application has been received against the 2 vacancies reserved for EWS and hence the recruitment process to fill up two vacancies of EWS has become infructuous at scrutiny stage.

(ii) **PwBD:** Two Applications have been received against one post reserved for PwBD – ‘Low Vision’ category. Both applications have been considered.

**Criteria adopted for short-listing** **EQ-A+ EQ-B**

As per the above criterion, scrutiny has been made and both applications were rejected under the following categories:-

**REJECTIONS**

<b>LEQ-A</b> (Lacking Essential Qualification –Educational)	<b>Roll No. 26</b>	<b>02 candidates</b>
<b>LEQ-B</b> (Lacking Essential Qualification of Experience)	<b>Roll No. 129</b>	

Total five applicants have claimed PwBD status (Roll No. 13, 26, 40, 109, 129). Among those 3 candidates (Roll No. 13, 40,109) were not belong the PwBD category (**Low Vision**) for which the post is reserved. Therefore, those Locomotive Disability candidates were examined under their respective caste category (Genl) as per eligibility applicable to the caste. Two candidates (Roll No. 26 and 129) belong to the PwBD reserved category of ‘**Low Vision**’. But Roll No. 26 was rejected under LEQ-A as the candidate was not fulfilling the Educational Qualification prescribed for the post. The Applicant was holding PG Diploma in pathology which is not considered as eligible qualification. Roll No.129 was rejected under LEQ-B as the candidate was not fulfilling the Experience criteria (EQ-B) of 3 years after completion of PG Degree. Candidate has got only 8 months valid experience after PG degree and therefore could not be considered even on relaxed criteria up 50% experience. As both the PwBD category candidates have been rejected and the recruitment action to fill up **one PwBD post has also become infructuous** at scrutiny stage. Hence the By virtue of 01-PwBD vacancy becoming infructuous, one UR vacancy (out of 6) has been kept unfilled and only **5 UR post** is proposed to be filled up.

8. Summary of **Final** short-listed applicants:-

Category	Final Short-listed applicants (Roll Nos.)
SC	145, 147, 148, 151, 152, 153, 155, 157, 159, 160, 161, 162 & 163 =13 Candidates
ST	166 & 167 =02 Candidates
OBC	132, 134, 135, 136, 138, 139, 141, 142 & 144 =09 Candidates
UR	04, 05, 06, 07, 13, 16, 18, 22, 25, 27, 29, 31, 35, 36, 37, 38, 41, 46, 48, 49, 50, 53, 58, 59, 60, 62, 67, 69, 70, 75, 77, 80, 86, 93, 98, 102, 104, 106, 112, 117, 120 & 127 = 42 Candidates

9. The following candidates have been rejected as noted against each:-

Rejection	Rejected applicants (Roll Nos.)
LEQ(A)	57 & 140 = 02candidate
LEQ(B)	133, 137, 149, 150, 154, 156, 158 & 164 = 08 candidates
No response to CFDs	143, 146, 150, 158 & 165 = 05 candidates
Lack of enhance Criteria ( <b>LEC</b> )	03, 08, 10, 17, 21, 28, 32, 33, 34, 42, 44, 51, 63, 66, 79, 82, 83, 85, 87, 90, 94, 96, 97, 108, 109, 110, 113, 114, 118, 119, 123, 125, 128 & 130 = 35 Candidates
Lacking Consideration Zone	Remaining 51 candidates

**No further correspondence on the subject will be entertained**

**(Amrish Kumar)**  
Deputy Secretary (R.1)  
Union Public Service Commission